



Reflection Micro-Workshops:

Assessing Reflection



Sapan Parekh

Associate Director, RISE Learning Institute

February 8, 2021

What Are We Doing Today?

Agenda

1. Challenges & Guidelines
2. Rubrics
3. ABC123
4. Other Considerations
5. Work Time

Challenges & Guidelines

What are some challenges for assessing reflections?

- It feels so subjective!
- How do make it count towards the course outcomes?
- I completely disagree with what the student wrote!
- How do I grade non-written reflections?

Challenges & Guidelines

Guidelines for Assessing Reflections:

- Determine whether the activity/assignment needs to be graded.
- Use a rubric to grade more objectively.
- Don't just grade. Give feedback.
- Introduce the students to the grading criteria early, and let them know what you're asking them to work towards.
- If the reflection connects to coursework and/or outcomes, ensure that one of the competencies / criteria allows you to gauge the depth of that learning.

Challenges & Guidelines

Guidelines for Assessing Reflections:

- Let students know that you are not grading how they feel, but how they present those feelings.
- Let students know that you are not grading their perspectives, but how they present and support those perspectives.
- Challenge the students, not by saying that they are wrong, but by asking why they think it.
- Validate their attempts and successes.

Rubrics

What is a Rubric?

- Down the left side: 3-5 **Competencies** you want students to demonstrate
- Across the top: 3-5 **Proficiency Levels** at which these competencies can be demonstrated
- Cells: Details about what that competency looks like at that proficiency level
- Grading: Use [Roobrix](#) to help grade correctly. Ensure that the lowest level is NOT a zero (or make sure that submissions are automatically worth something)
- Best Practice: Share the rubrics in advance, and give students a chance to practice using it to score example works

Rubrics

VALUE Rubrics

- Created by the AAC&U to cover topics that are tough to grade
- Instructors can take these apart and use them as they see fit

Civic Engagement

Information Literacy

Quantitative Literacy

Creative Thinking

Integrative Learning

Reading

Critical Thinking

Intercultural Knowledge

Teamwork

Ethical Reasoning

Lifelong Learning

Written Communication

Global Learning

Oral Communication

Inquiry & Analysis

Problem Solving



Grading Rubric for Reflection Assignments

Educ 1100 Human Diversity & PEA 299 Intercultural Understanding and Competence: Spring 2004 - Vaxjo University: Kajsa Higgins & Helen Mongan-Rallis

Categories	Exemplary	Intermediate	Beginning
Self-disclosure	[3 points] Seeks to understand concepts by examining <i>openly</i> your own experiences in the past as they relate to the topic, to illustrate points you are making. Demonstrates an <i>open, non-defensive ability to self-appraise</i> , discussing both growth and frustrations as they related to learning in class. Risks asking probing questions about self and seeks to answer these.	[2 points] Seeks to understand concepts by examining <i>somewhat cautiously</i> your own experiences in the past as they relate to the topic. Sometimes defensive or one-sided in your analysis. Asks some probing questions about self, but do not engage in seeking to answer these.	[1 point] <i>Little self-disclosure, minimal risk</i> in connecting concepts from class to personal experiences. Self-disclosure tends to be superficial and factual, without self-reflection.
Connection to outside experiences	[3 points] <i>In-depth synthesis</i> of thoughtfully selected aspects of experiences related to the topic. Makes <i>clear</i> connections between what is learned from outside experiences and the topic.	[2 points] Goes into <i>some detail</i> explaining some specific ideas or issues from outside experiences related to the topic. Makes <i>general</i> connections between what is learned from outside experiences and the topic.	[1 point] Identify some <i>general ideas</i> or issues from outside experiences related to the topic
Connection to readings (assigned and ones you have sought on your own)	[3 points] <i>In-depth synthesis</i> of thoughtfully selected aspects of readings related to the topic. Makes <i>clear</i> connections between what is learned from readings and the topic. Demonstrate further analysis and insight resulting from what you have learned from reading. Includes reference to at least two readings other than those assigned for class.	[2 points] Goes into more detail explaining some specific ideas or issues from readings related to the topic. Makes general connections between what is learned from readings and the topic. Includes reference to at least one reading other than those assigned for class.	[1 point] Identify some general ideas or issues from readings related to the topic. Readings are only those assigned for the topic.
Connection to class discussions & course objectives	[3 points] Synthesize, analyze and evaluate thoughtfully selected aspects of ideas or issues from the class discussion as they relate to this topic.	[2 points] Synthesize clearly some directly appropriate ideas or issues from the class discussion as they relate to this topic.	[1 point] Restate some general ideas or issues from the class discussion as they relate to this topic.
Spelling & grammar errors	[2 points] No spelling or grammar errors.	[1 point] Few spelling and grammar errors.	[0 points] Many spelling and grammar errors, use of incomplete sentences, inadequate proof reading.
Total Score: 12-14 points = A; 9-11 points = B; 5-8 points = C			

ABC123

- Adapted from Marshall Welch
- All reflections should include the following:
 - Affect (personal connection and feelings)
 - Behavior (past, present, and/or future actions)
 - Connection / Cognition / Content / Context (relevance to the class)
- Use a method of grading to build student critical thinking, avoid “warbling” (writing what the student thinks the instructor wants to read), and move reflection away from the idea that it is a “freebie activity”
- Do not grade based on the number of times the ABCs are mentioned, but on the quality of these mentions
- The goal is to move students to the maximum score by the quarter’s end

ABC123

- Grade reflective papers between 1 and 3 based on depth in each category
 - 1: Marginal attention and/or cursory thought
 - 2: Essential details but without insight and intentionality
 - 3: In-depth responses with intentional consideration and rich articulation
- Another consideration of '123' travels through three levels of awareness:
 - 1: Self (self-centered, egoistic, focused on 'I' – tends to be a starting point)
 - 2: Empathetic (provide insight and/or appreciation of others' experiences and/or perspectives)
 - 3: Systemic (acknowledge previously unknown or unconsidered systemic variables)

ABC123

First Scoring Modality

	Marginal (1)	Essential (2)	Insightful (3)
Affect (personal feeling)			
Behavior (actions)			
Context (course)			

Note: It is not about how much the student writes, but about the quality of what's written.

ABC123

Second Scoring Modality

- Did the reflection bring up Affect, Behavior, and/or Context? How many?
 - Give score of 1, 2, or 3
- Does the reflection get to the Self (1), Empathetic (2), or Systemic (3) level?
 - Multiply the ABC score by this value
- Students can score between 1 and 9. Consider having the assignment be worth 25 points (give an automatic 16 for submitting it).

Other Considerations

- Not all reflections need to be graded
 - This is particularly true for formative reflections used to gauge student understanding and preparedness
- Rubrics can be made that fit within the What-So What-Now What and other frameworks
- Rubrics also exist for assessing group and online discussions
- The choice to assess reflections comes down to what the purpose of that reflection is, and whether you are using it to help students meet course or personal growth outcomes

Work Time

- 1) Pick a reflective assignment for which you would want to create a rubric
- 2) Review the various examples of rubrics
- 3) Determine the competencies you want students to demonstrate, and the number of proficiency levels.
- 4) Consideration: How will you overlay this rubric with grading? At what proficiency level will you know that students have demonstrated those competencies?

References

Dubinsky, J., Welch, M., & Wurr, A. (2012). Composing Cognition: The Role of Written Reflections in Service-Learning. Retrieved from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/317128902_Composing_Cognition_The_Role_of_Written_Reflections_in_Service-Learning

Oates, K.K., & Leavitt, L.H. (2003). *Service-Learning & Learning Communities: Tools for Integrational Assessment*. Washington, D.C.: Association of American Colleges & Universities.

Welch, M. (1999): "The ABCs of Reflection: A Template for Students and Instructors to Implement Written Reflection in Service-Learning". *Evaluation/Reflection* 16. Retrieved from: <http://digitalcommons.unomaha.edu/slceeval/16>

